

FACULTY OF HUMANITIES  
SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES  
COURSE UNIT OUTLINE 2012-2013

## SOAN 30352/60352: ANTHROPOLOGY OF THE MODERN STATE

Semester: TWO

**Lecturer(s):** Dr Madeleine Reeves  
**Room:** 2.054 Arthur Lewis Building  
**Telephone:** 0161 275 3488  
**Email:** [madeleine.reeves@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:madeleine.reeves@manchester.ac.uk)  
**Office Hours:** Monday and Thursday, 2-3pm, teaching weeks only  
**Administrator:** [Lynn.Dignan@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:Lynn.Dignan@manchester.ac.uk) undergraduate  
[victoria.roche@manchester.ac.uk](mailto:victoria.roche@manchester.ac.uk) postgraduate  
**Lectures:** Thursday 09.00-12.00 Roscoe 3.4  
**PG seminar:** Thursday 13.00-14.00, 2.066, beginning February 5<sup>th</sup>.

COURSE CODE	UNDERGRADUATE	POSTGRADUATE
	SOAN30352	SOAN60352
NUMBER OF CREDITS	20	15
MODE OF ASSESSMENT All deadlines are 2.00 pm (UK time)	10% - 4 seminar reports 20% - Book Review (12 <sup>th</sup> March) 70% - Final Essay (14 <sup>th</sup> May)	20% - Book Review (12 <sup>th</sup> March) 80% - Final Essay (7 <sup>th</sup> May)
<b>Word Limits for Assessed Work:</b> Students exceeding the maximum word limits on assessed work will be penalised. There is no formal minimum word limit, but students should consider whether essays that fall substantially below the maximum have adequately covered the topic. An automated word-count must be printed on each piece of work – failure to do so will result in an automatic deduction of 2%.		
<b>PENALTIES FOR LATE SUBMISSION OF ASSESSED WORK</b> There is an <b>absolute deadline of 2.00 pm</b> on all hand-ins. Late submission of essays and other coursework will be penalised. The penalty is <b>10 points per day</b> for up to 10 days (including weekends) for any assessed work submitted after the specified submission deadline. <b>Social Sciences students</b> should contact the Social Sciences Undergraduate Office (G.001 Arthur Lewis Building) or the Social Sciences Postgraduate Office (2 <sup>nd</sup> floor landing) if they feel they have mitigating circumstances. <b>All other students</b> should follow the procedures of their Home Schools. A "day" is 24 hours, i.e. the clock starts ticking as soon as the submission deadline ( <b>2.00 pm</b> ) has passed. Unless a student has an <b>authorised</b> extension, any assessed work that is submitted late will be penalised.		
<b>There are no pre-requisites for this course. However, students should consider whether it is advisable to take an advanced level course, without any prior knowledge of the subject, at this crucial stage in their academic career.</b>		

## **SOAN 30352/ 60352**

### **The Anthropology of the Modern State**

**Dr. Madeleine Reeves**

#### **Course overview**

---

What is the state, and how might we try to understand it ethnographically? These two big questions have been some of the most generative in recent political anthropology; and are also urgent questions of our time. What, if anything, constitutes state sovereignty today? Should we make a categorical difference between (legitimate) state and (illegitimate) non-state violence? Is state power being eroded as a result of globalization? Or is it being re-constituted in new ways? Can we even generalize in any meaningful sense about “the” state, or does that term conceal the empirical variety of political formations that exist in the world today?

This course explores some of the answers that have been developed in anthropology and kindred fields to these questions. We will situate these questions and answers historically, looking at the way in which anthropologists have come to ask certain kinds of questions about the state at certain historical moments and political junctures. We will explore them comparatively, drawing on a range of empirical examples from North and Sub-Saharan Africa, Latin America, East, South, and Central Asia, Europe, the Middle East and North America. During the course we will consider debates around the “capillary” workings of governmental power influenced by Michel Foucault; at the politicization of life and death often glossed as “biopolitics”; at the technologies and infrastructures through which the state comes to take on material form in daily life; and at recent concerns to explore how, in contexts of formal state weakness, localized zones of sovereignty are sustained. Following this we will consider the complex relationship between states, illegality and violence, exploring what happens when informal sources of protection are experienced as more secure against arbitrary violence than those notionally authorized by the state.

In the later part of the course we turn to debates about democracy, participation and popular statism. We look at recent concern to attend to the affective and emotive dimensions of statehood, attending to what Jonathan Spencer has identified as the “moral investment that many people make in the idea of being owners, or at least members, of a state of their own”. We consider this alongside recent ethnographic explorations (and scholarly defences of) anarchism, ending to come full circle to questions of the complex intersections between anthropology, the state, and political critique.

## **Organisation of the course**

---

The course is organized around a core 3-hour session on Thursday each week. This will consist of a lecture of approximately 70 minutes, followed by a break, after which the UG students will be split into two 40 minute (+/-) seminars, one following immediately after the other (a separate tutorial will be held for MA students at 1pm on Thursdays, beginning February 5th). UG students will be randomly allocated to one or other seminar during the first class. For any given seminar there will be 2 or more presenters who are responsible for giving a 5-7-minute presentation on the basis of their seminar report to the rest of the group that week. *This is a reading-based course and you will be asked to leave the seminar if you have not done the key readings, or brought along a copy of the readings (in hard copy or electronically) and your own notes.*

### **Seminar preparation**

You should come to the class having read the key readings designated for each week, and having formulated three questions that you would like to pose to the class for the group to discuss in relation to the readings. These can be questions of comprehension or meaning (e.g. "what does Trouillot mean by describing the state as a 'lived fiction of late modernity' on p. 130"?), but at least one should be a substantive question relating to (what you understand to be) the theoretical stakes of the argument in question ("Abrams seems to suggest that the purpose of a political sociology of the state is 'demystification'. But how can such an approach help us better to make sense of, or put stops upon, state-sponsored violence?") There are no "right" and "wrong" questions to ask of the texts—there are only more or less penetrating or interesting ones. We will write an assortment of the questions that are asked on the board each week, so you should come to the seminar prepared to use your questions to open up discussion.

This is also a course in which you are actively invited to hone your ethnographic sensibilities in daily life, and to think theoretically with what you observe. The "state" and its traces, its modes of governance, its gaps, as well as the hopes and desires it elicits are all around us, symbolically, materially, discursively. You are actively encouraged to document your own 'state encounters' ethnographically and visually in this course and to use the theoretical tools you will be honing to reflect upon them. Thus, you are invited and encouraged to bring these instances that can document this (notes, photographs, leaflets you have picked up, comments overheard, signs or summons you have observed ...) to the seminar and to discuss them with your peers in the light of our theoretical discussion.

## **Assessment**

For Undergraduates assessment will consist of the following:

1. 4 X 400 word seminar reports (10%)
2. 1 X 1000 word book review (20%)
3. 1 X 3000 word final essay (70%)

For Postgraduates assessment will consist of the following:

1. 1 X 1000 word book review (20%)
2. 1 X 3000 word final essay (80%)

## **Seminar presentation**

One of the key goals of the course is for students to gain experience of presenting their ideas and responses to text in a variety of formats: in the form of questions relating to the key reading; in the form of a book review of the kind that might be found in an academic journal; in the form of an extended final essay; and, for BA students, in the form of a non-assessed seminar presentation. It may be helpful to think of the latter as a mini-lecture (7 mins) which YOU give to your peers, introducing them to a text that most of your fellow students will not already be familiar. You should prepare power-point slides or a hand-out, and you should think about how you introduce the text, present the key arguments, and its links to the key readings in such a way that it is accessible and comprehensible to your fellow students. You are encouraged to audio-record or film your presentation and listen to it/ watch it afterwards, as there will be dedicated office-hour feedback sessions for each of the presenters to reflect on and improve their presentation skills. The week in which a given student is to give their seminar presentation will be allocated during the first class.

## **Book review**

A 1000 word book review is required of both BA and MA students, and should discuss one of the ethnographic monographs listed at the end of the course outline, or another relevant monograph by prior agreement. Detailed guidance on how to write a balanced, engaging book review will be given during class. This is due for submission on Blackboard by **12<sup>th</sup> March**.

## **Final essay**

All students are required to write a 3000 word final essay, addressing one of a number of pre-given questions. This essay should show evidence of

having read at least two ethnographic monographs, which can include the monograph on which you wrote the book review. The ethnographic monographs are highlighted in bold in the list of weekly readings, or you can use a second of the monographs listed at the end of the course outline. This is due for submission by **14<sup>th</sup> May (Undergraduates) and 7<sup>th</sup> May (Postgraduates)**.

## **Feedback**

Feedback is offered in a variety of formats: in the form of in-class commentary; in the form of written feedback on the book review and final essay; and in the form of oral feedback on the seminar presentation. Students are encouraged to make use of Madeleine's office hours, which will be announced in the first week.

## **Email correspondence**

We all get a lot of email -- please remember good email etiquette (even if you are sending an email from your phone!):

- Give a precise, relevant subject heading
- Please begin 'Dear [first name]...'
- Sign off with your name

It is very helpful while I am still learning everyone's names if you can remind me in the first line of your email which year you are in (2/3/MA) and that the message relates to the Anthropology of the State Course.

## **Library reading list**

If it is not already, the library should become a well-loved hang-out! This is a reading-intensive course, and you will benefit from dipping into multiple book-length ethnographic monographs, which have been ordered for this course. Wherever possible (ie. where copyright permits), book chapters and journal articles will be available via the library reading list for the course (<http://www.readinglists.manchester.ac.uk/lists/FA5C5D7C-6FEB-8B36-A8F3-3E7253D59D5A.html>). This will be updated throughout the course and you should use it alongside this course unit outline to access readings.

**Summary of weekly topics and activities due for class (excluding seminar presentations)**

<b>Week</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Theme</b>	<b>Activity due ahead of class</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>29.01</b>	Introduction	Read through course outline Key reading and 3 questions
<b>2</b>	<b>05.02</b>	Culture and ideology	Key reading and 3 questions
<b>3</b>	<b>12.02</b>	Governmentality	Key reading and 3 questions
<b>4</b>	<b>19.02</b>	Biopolitics	Key reading and 3 questions
<b>5</b>	<b>26.02</b>	Infrastructure and encompassment	Key reading and 3 questions
<b>6</b>	<b>05.03</b>	Law and disorder	Key reading and 3 questions
<b>7</b>	<b>12.03</b>	Sovereignty	Key reading and 3 questions Book review due via blackboard
<b>8</b>	<b>19.03</b>	Democracy	Key reading and 3 questions
		EASTER BREAK – NO CLASS	
NB – NO CLASS 16.04 – ASA CONFERENCE			
<b>9</b>	<b>23.04</b>	Affect and popular statism	Key reading and 3 questions
<b>10</b>	<b>30.04</b>	Anarchism and anthropological critique	Key reading and 3 questions

**Background reading**

The following edited collections provide some useful introductions to the anthropology of the state, and several of the chapters that they contain will be referenced during the course. If you decide to purchase one book for the course, the *Blackwell Reader in the Anthropology of the State* edited by Sharma and Gupta (marked \* below) is highly recommended, as we will be reading several chapters from it during the course. Copies of this book will be ordered for purchase from Blackwell's.

Begona Aretxaga. 2005. *States of Terror: Begona Aretxaga's Essays*. Reno: Center for Basque Studies.

Thomas Bierschenk and Jean-Pierre Olivier de Sardan. 2014. *States at Work: Dynamics of African Bureaucracies*. Leiden: Brill.

John and Jean Comaroff. 2006. *Law and Disorder in the Postcolony*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Veena Das and Deborah Poole, eds. 2004. *Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press.

C.J. Fuller and Veronique Benei. 2001. *The Everyday State and Society in Modern India*. London: Hurst and Co.

John Gledhill. 2000. *Power and Its Disguises: Anthropological Perspectives on Politics*. London: Pluto.

Thomas Blom Hansen and Finn Steputat, eds. 2001. *States of Imagination: Ethnographic Explorations of the Postcolonial State*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Thomas Blom Hansen and Finn Steputat, eds. 2005. *Sovereign Bodies: Citizens, Migrants and States in the Postcolonial World*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Christian Krohn-Hansesn and Knut Nustad., eds. 2005. *State Formation: Anthropological Perspectives*. London: Pluto.

David Nugent and Joan Vincent, eds. 2004. *A Companion to the Anthropology of Politics*. Oxford: Blackwell

Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasanayagam and Judith Beyer, eds. 2014. *Ethnographies of the State in Central Asia: Performing Politics*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

\*Aradhana Sharma and Akil Gupta, eds. 2006. *The Anthropology of the State: A Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell.

Jonathan Spencer. 2007. *Anthropology, Politics and the State: Democracy and Violence in South Asia*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

George Steinmetz. 1999. *State/Culture: State Formation After the Cultural Turn*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Joan Vincent. 2002. *The Anthropology of Politics: A Reader in Ethnography, Theory, and Critique*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell.

# Readings and course content

## Week 1:

### Thinking the state anthropologically: some starting points

---

*In this first session, we begin by asking about what the state is and why it has become a central focus for the articulation of political projects in the modern world. How has anthropology defined itself in relation to the state and so-called "stateless societies"? What might an anthropology of the state look like? And why is "the state" so difficult to grasp, empirically and conceptually?*

#### Essential reading

Michel-Rolph Trouillot. 2001. "The Anthropology of the State in the Age of Globalization: Close Encounters of a Deceptive Kind." *Current Anthropology* 42 (1): 125-138.

Jonathan Spencer. 2007. "States and Persons". In *Anthropology, Politics and the State: Democracy and Violence in South Asia*, 96-117. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

#### Further reading

John Gledhill. 2009. "Power in Political Anthropology." *Journal of Power* 2 (1): 9-34.

Christian Krohn-Hansen and Knut Nustad. 2005. "Introduction" to *State Formation: Anthropological Perspectives*, 3-26. London: Pluto.

A.R. Radcliffe-Brown. 1940. 'Preface', in *African Political Systems*, ed. M. Fortes and E. E. Evans-Pritchard, x-xxiii. London: Oxford University Press for the International African Institute.

Jonathan Spencer. 2007. "The Strange Death of Political Anthropology" and "Locating the Political" in *Anthropology, Politics and the State: Democracy and Violence in South Asia*, 1-47. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

## **Week 2:**

### **Imagining and unmasking the state: questions of culture and ideology**

---

*One influential approach to thinking the state anthropologically is to explore how it is constituted as a (seeming) singularity in public culture. Why has the language of "imagination" become so productive for anthropologists interested in understanding the state? How helpful is it to think of the state as a "mask" that conceals relations of subjection and inequality?*

#### **Essential reading**

Phillip Abrams. 1988 [1977]. "Notes on the Difficulty of Studying the State." *Journal of Historical Sociology* (1)1: 58-89. [Also in the Sharma and Gupta Reader, 114-130].

Akhil Gupta. 1994. "Blurred Boundaries: The Discourse of Corruption, the Culture of Politics, and the Imagined State." *American Ethnologist* 22 (2): 375-402. [Also in the Sharma and Gupta Reader, 211-242].

#### **Further reading**

Judith Beyer. 2007. "Imagining the State in Rural Kyrgyzstan: How Perceptions of the State Create Customary Law in Kyrgyz Aksakal Courts." *Max Planck Institute for Social Anthropology Working Paper* 95.

John T. Friedman. 2011. *Imagining the Post-Apartheid State: An Ethnographic Account of Namibia*. New York and Oxford: Berghahn.

#### **Ethnographic monograph**

Thomas Hansen and Finn Stepputat. "Introduction: States of Imagination". In Hansen and Stepputat, eds., *States of Imagination: Ethnographic Explorations of the Postcolonial State*, 1-38. Durham: Duke University Press.

Gilbert Joseph and Daniel Nugent. 1994. "Popular Culture and State Formation in Revolutionary Mexico". In Gilbert Joseph and Daniel Nugent, eds., *Everyday Forms of State Formation: Revolution and the Negotiation of Rule in Modern Mexico*, 3-23. Durham: Duke University Press.

William Roseberry. 1994 "Hegemony and the language of contention." In Gilbert Joseph and Daniel Nugent, eds., *Everyday Forms of State Formation: Revolution and the Negotiation of Rule in Modern Mexico*, 355-366. Durham: Duke University Press.

## **Week 3:**

### **Discipline and development: questions of governmentality**

---

*This work we turn to the way in which anthropologists have deployed the concept of governmentality associated with Michel Foucault to understand political techniques and rationalities of rule, on the one hand, and the processes by which subjects are rendered governable and self-disciplining (or what Foucault called "techniques of the self"), on the other. We will consider how a concern with the everyday conduct of conduct, influenced by Foucault, has shaped anthropological research on the state; what such an approach illuminates, and what it potentially obscures.*

#### **Essential reading**

Michel Foucault. 2006 [1991]. "Governmentality." In Aradhana Shama and Akhil Gupta, eds., *The Anthropology of the State: A Reader*, 131-143. Oxford: Blackwell.

Jula Elyachar. 2003. "Mappings of Power: The State, NGOs, and International Organizations in the Informal Economy of Cairo." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 45 (3): 571-605. Also as Chapter 3 of *Markets of Dispossession* (see below).

#### **Further reading**

Julia Elyachar. 2005. *Markets of Dispossession: NGOs, Economic Development, and the State in Cairo*. Durham: Duke University Press.

#### **Ethnographic monograph**

James Ferguson. 1994. "The Anti-Politics Machine." From Aradhana Shama and Akhil Gupta, eds., *The Anthropology of the State: A Reader*. Oxford: Blackwell, 270-290.

Sarah Friedman. 2005. 'The intimacy of state power: marriage, liberation and socialist subjects in Southeastern China' *American Ethnologist* 32:2, 312-327.

Maia Green. 2010 After Ujamaa, Cultures of Governance and the Representation of Power in Tanzania. *Social Analysis* 54 (1), 15-34.

Akil Gupta and James Ferguson. 2002. "Spatializing States: Towards an Ethnography of Neoliberal Governmentality." *American Ethnologist* 29 (4): 981-1002.

Akhil Gupta. 2012. *Red Tape: Bureaucracy, Structural Violence, and Poverty in India*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Matthew Hull. 2012. *Government of Paper: The Materiality of Bureaucracy in Urban Pakistan*. Berkeley: University of California Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Thomas Lemke. 2001 "The Birth of Bio-Politics: Michel Foucault's Lecture at the College de France on Neoliberal Governmentality." *Economy and Society* 30 (2), 190-207.

Tania Murray Li. 1999. 'Compromising power: development, culture, and rule in Indonesia' *Cultural Anthropology* 14:3, 295-435.

Tania Murray Li. 2007. *The Will to Improve: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Timothy Mitchell. 1999. "Society, Economy, and the State Effect." In George Steinmetz, ed., *State/Culture: State-Formation After the Cultural Turn*, 76-97. Ithaca: Cornell University Press. [Also available in the Sharma and Gupta Reader, 169-186].

Knut Nustad. 2005. "State Formation Through Development in Post-Apartheid South Africa." In Christian Krohn-Hansen and Knut Nustad, eds., *State Formation: Anthropological Perspectives*, 79-95. London: Pluto Press.

Joe Painter. 2006. "Prosaic Geographies of Stateness." *Political Geography* 25: 752-774.

Rebecca Stein. 2012. "State Tube: Anthropological Reflections on Social Media and the Israeli State". *Anthropological Quarterly* 85 (3): 893-916.

## **Week 4:**

### **Regulating life and death: questions of biopolitics**

---

*This week we consider the "more or less rationalized attempts by different authorities to intervene upon the vital characteristics of human existence—human beings as living creatures who are born, mature, have a body that can be trained and augmented, and then sicken and die." (Rose) Often this "rationalized concern" is glossed as biopolitics. We consider how and why states and non-state agencies have come to be concerned with these questions of human vitality and mortality; how*

*certain forms of medical suffering become integral to the articulation of political membership or successful claims to political asylum; and how life itself becomes politicized in this process. Which lives and deaths matter to states, which do not, and why? And what can biopolitics teach us about state power?*

### **Essential reading**

Rose, Nikolas. 2007. "Politics and Life". In Niklas Rose, *The Politics of Life Itself: Biomedicine, Power, and Subjectivity in the Twenty-First Century*, 41-76. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Adriana Petryna. 2002. *Life Exposed: Biological Citizenship After Chernobyl*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1-33; 114-148 and 215-220.

### **Further reading**

Lawrence Cohen. 2004. "Operability: Surgery at the Margin of the State." In Veena Das and Deborah Poole, eds., *Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press, 165-90.

Jean Comaroff. 2010 "Beyond Bare Life: AIDS, Biopolitics, and the (Neo)liberal Order." In Hansjorg Dilger and Ute Luig, ed., *Morality, Hope, and Grief: Anthropologies of AIDS in Africa*, 21-42. Oxford: Berghahn.

Didier Fassin and Estelle d'Halluin. 2005. "The Truth from the Body: Medical Certificates as Ultimate Evidence for Asylum Seekers". *American Anthropologist* 107 (4): 597-608.

Michel Foucault. 1977. "Right of death and power over life". In *The History of Sexuality, Volume 1*. London: Penguin.

Susan Greenhalgh. 2008. *Just One Child: Science and Policy in Deng's China*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Stef Jansen. 2009. "After the Red Passport: An Anthropology of the Everyday Geopolitics of Entrapment in the EUs 'Immediate Outside'". *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 15, 815-832.

Diane Nelson. "Life During Wartime: Gutamala, Vitality, Conspiracy, Milieu." In Jonathan Xavier Inda, ed., *Anthropologies of Modernity: Foucault, Governmentality, and Life Politics*. Oxford: Blackwell, 215-247.

Adriana Petryna. 20 "Science and Citizenship Under Postsocialism". In *Anthropologies of Modernity: Foucault, Governmentality, and Life Politics*. Oxford: Blackwell, 158-177.

Alice Street. 2014. *Biomedicine in an Unstable Place*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

## **Week 5:**

### **Material traces of the state: questions of infrastructure and encompassment**

---

*This week we turn to works that have sought to understand the technical, material and spatial organization of state power. How does the state come to be seen as existing "over" society and encompassing it? How is rule practically materialized, in tarmac and concrete, in pipes and fences and barbed wire? How might a focus on infrastructure enable a more variegated account of state presence (and absence) in everyday life? Can we talk of a "material turn" in the study of the state, and what does it offer?*

#### **Essential reading**

Stephen Collier. 2004. "Pipes". In Stephen Harrison, Steve Pile and Nigel Thrift, eds., *Patterned Ground: Entanglements of Nature and Culture*, 50-52. Reaktion books.

Penny Harvey. 2005. "The Materiality of State-Effects: An Ethnography of a Road in the Peruvian Andes." In Christian Krohn-Hansen and Knut Nustad, eds., *State Formation: Anthropological Perspectives*, 123-141. London: Pluto Press.

Elizabeth Dunn. 2008. "Postsocialist Spores: Disease, Bodies and the State in the Republic of Georgia." *American Ethnologist* 35 (2): 243-258.

#### **Further reading**

Nikhil Anand. 2012. "Municipal disconnect: on abject water and its urban infrastructures". *Ethnography* 13 (4): 487-509.

James Ferguson. 2005 "Seeing Like an Oil Company: Space, Security and Global Capital in Neoliberal Africa". *American Anthropologist* 107(3):377-382.

Stef Jansen. 2015. "Waiting for a bus [or, towards an anthropology of gridding]," In *Yearnings in the Meantime: 'Normal Lives' and the State in a Sarajevo Apartment Complex*. Oxford: Berghahn [NB: Not yet published; ask MR for a copy of the chapter].

Patrick Joyce. 2008. "Postal Communication and the Making of the British Technostate." CRESC Working Paper 54, 1-23.  
<http://www.cresc.ac.uk/sites/default/files/wp54.pdf>

Donald Moore. 2005. *Suffering for Territory: Race, Place, and Power in Zimbabwe*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Chandra Mukerji. "The Unintended State." In Tony Bennett and Patrick Joyce, eds., *Material Powers: Cultural Studies, History and the Material Turn*, 81-101. London: Routledge.

Sarah Radcliffe. 2001. "Imagining the State as a Space: Territoriality and the Formation of the State in Ecuador." In Thomas Hansen and Finn Stepputat, eds., *States of Imagination: Ethnographic Explorations of the Postcolonial State*, 123-145. Durham: Duke University Press.

Madeleine Reeves. 2014. "Roads of hope and dislocation: infrastructure and the remaking of territory at a Central Asian Border. *Ab Imperio* 2 (2014): 235-247.

Madeleine Reeves. 2014. *Border Work: Spatial Lives of the State in Rural Central Asia*. **Ethnographic monograph**

## **Week 6: Policing and producing dis/order: questions of ethics and illegality**

---

*This week we explore relationship between states and illegality. Weberian accounts of the state as definitional a claim that the state has a monopoly on "legitimate violence"; many Foucauldian-inspired accounts point to the way in which the state seeks to order and rationalize: to govern through rendering legible. This week we ask the question: is this always the case? Are there situations in which the state thrives on the production of illegibility or illegality? And what happens when informal sources of protection are experienced as more secure against arbitrary violence than those notionally authorized by the state?*

### **Essential reading**

Janet Roitman. 2004. "Productivity in the Margins: The Reconstitution of State Power in the Chad Basin. *In Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Veena Das and Deborah Poole, eds. Pp. 191-224. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press.

[OR

Janet Roitman. 2006. "The Ethics of Illegality in the Chad Basin." In John Comaroff and Jean Comaroff, eds., *Law and Disorder in the Postcolony*, 247-272. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.]

Josiah Heyman and Alan Smart. "States and Illegal Practices: An Overview." In Josiah Heyman, ed., *States and Illegal Practices*, 1-24. Oxford: Berg.

### **Further reading**

Ruben Andersson. 2014. *Illegality, Inc.* Berkeley: University of California Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Talal Asad. "Where are the margins of the state?" in Veena Das and Deborah Poole, eds., *Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press, 279-288.

Janet Roitman. 2005. *Fiscal Disobedience: An Anthropology of Economic Regulation in Central Africa*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

John and Jean Comaroff. 2006 "Law and Disorder in the Postcolony: An Introduction." In *Law and Disorder in the Postcolony*, 1-56. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Peter Geschiere. 2006. "Witchcraft and the Limits of the Law: Cameroon and South Africa." In John and Jean Comaroff, eds., *Law and Disorder in the Postcolony*, 219-256. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Tobias Kelly. 2007. "Law and Disorder in the Palestinian West Bank: The Execution of Suspected Collaborators under Israeli Occupation". In David Pratten and Atreyee Sen, eds., *Global Vigilantes: Perspectives on Justice and Violence*. London: Hurst and Co, 151-173.

Carolyn Nordstrom. 2000. "Shadows and Sovereigns." *Theory, Culture and Society* 17 (4); 35-54

Deborah Poole. 2004. "Between Threat and Guarantee: Justice and Community on the Margins of the Peruvian State." In Veena Das and Deborah Poole, eds., *Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press, 37-65.

David Price. 1998 "Cold War Anthropology: Collaborators and Victims of the National Security State." *Identities* 4(3-4): 389-430

Nancy Ries. 2002. Honest Bandits and Warped People: Russian Narratives of Money, Corruption, and Moral Decay. In *Ethnography in Unstable Places: Everyday Lives in Contexts of Dramatic Political Change*. Carol J.

Greenhouse, Elizabeth Mertz, and Kay B. Warren, eds. Durham & London: Duke University Press. pp. 275-315

Atreyee Sen and David Pratten. "Global Vigilantes: Perspectives on Justice and Violence". In David Pratten and Atreyee Sen, eds., *Global Vigilantes: Perspectives on Justice and Violence*, 1-21. London: Hurst.

Charles Tilly. 1985. "War Making and State Making as Organised Crime." In *Bringing the State Back In*. In Peter Evans, Dietrich Rueschemeyer, and Theda Skocpol, pp. 67–95. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

## **Week 7:**

### **Whose rules rule? Questions of sovereignty**

---

*One fertile area of research in recent anthropology has been the question of state (and non-state) sovereignty—the capacity to decide which rules and whose rules really rule in any given situation. This week we look at settings where state sovereignty is variously contested—and the appropriations that Caroline Humphrey calls "localized forms of sovereignty". What can an anthropological perspective contribute to debates about sovereignty that have tended to be dominated by the disciplines of political science and international relations? And how might attention to informal, non-state sovereigns contribute to the anthropology of the state?*

#### **Essential reading**

Caroline Humphrey. 2004. "Sovereignty." In David Nugent and Joan Vincent, eds., *A Companion to the Anthropology of Politics*, 418-436. Oxford: Blackwell.

Chelsey Kivland. 2012. "Unmaking the State in 'Occupied' Haiti." *Political and Legal Anthropology Review* 35 (2): 258-270.

#### **Further reading**

Begona Aretxaga. 2003. "Maddening States." *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 32: 393-410.

Thomas Blom Hansen and Finn Steputat. "Introduction". In Thomas Blom Hansen and Finn Steputat, eds., *Sovereign Bodies: Citizens, Migrants, and States in the Postcolonial World*, 1-38. Durham: Duke University Press.

Brenda Chalfin. 2010. *Neoliberal Frontiers: An Ethnography of Sovereignty in West Africa*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

#### **Ethnographic monograph**

- Brenda Chalfin. 2006. "Global Customs Regimes and the Traffic in Sovereignty." *Current Anthropology*, 243-276 (and commentary).
- Jane Cowan. 2007. "The Supervised State." *Identities Global Studies in Culture and Power*, 14 (5): 545-578.
- Nicholas De Genova. 2010. "The Deportation Regime: Sovereignty, Space, and the Freedom of Movement." In Nicholas De Genova and Nathalie Peutz, eds., *The Deportation Regime: Sovereignty, Space, and the Freedom of Movement*. 34-65.
- Jessica Greenberg. 2011. 'On the road to normal: negotiating agency and state sovereignty in postsocialist Serbia' *American Anthropologist* 113:1, 88-100
- Louisa Lombard. 2012. *Raiding Sovereignty in Central African Borderlands*. PhD dissertation, Duke University. **Ethnographic monograph**  
[http://dukespace.lib.duke.edu/dspace/bitstream/handle/10161/5861/Lombard\\_duke\\_0066D\\_11603.pdf?sequence=1](http://dukespace.lib.duke.edu/dspace/bitstream/handle/10161/5861/Lombard_duke_0066D_11603.pdf?sequence=1)
- Dennis Rodgers. "The State as a Gang: Conceptualizing the Governmentality of Violence in Contemporary Nicaragua." *Critique of Anthropology* 26 (3): 315-330.
- Daniyn Rutherford. 2012. *Laughing at Leviathan: Sovereignty and Audience in West Papua*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.  
**Ethnographic monograph**
- Victorial Sanford. 2004. "Contesting Displacement in Columbia: Citizenship and State Sovereignty at the Margins". In *Anthropology in the Margins of the State*. Veena Das and Deborah Poole, eds. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press, 253-277.
- Audra Simpson. 2014. *Mohawk Interruptus: Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States*. Durham: Duke University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**
- David Sneath. 2007. "Introduction" and "The Headless State: Aristocratic Orders and the Substrata of Power." In *The Headless State: Aristocratic Orders, Kinship Society, and Misrepresentations of Nomadic Inner Asia*. New York: Columbia University Press, (esp. pp. 1-38 and 181-204).  
**Ethnographic monograph**

## Week 8:

### **The promise of participation: questions of democracy**

---

*Democracy offers the promise that—albeit fleetingly—“the people” control their own political destiny. It thus presents a rich terrain for critical ethnographic enquiry into contemporary statehood. Yet, as Jonathan Spencer notes, anthropologists have only recently begun to devote attention to exploring how democracy works, or fails to work, as an institutional and technical project, as a site of political participation, and as focus of intense emotional investment. How have ethnographers sought to account for the (sometimes paradoxical) appeal of democratic participation in contexts of enduring inequality? How do electoral processes enable or exacerbate village-level divisions? And what can ethnographic attention to the moral and performative dynamics of elections contribute to the anthropology of the state?*

#### **Essential reading**

Mukulika Banerjee. 2011. "Elections as Communitas". *Social Research* 78 (1): 75-98.

[http://www2.lse.ac.uk/anthropology/pdf/banerjee\\_elections.pdf](http://www2.lse.ac.uk/anthropology/pdf/banerjee_elections.pdf)

Kimberley Coles. 2004. "Election Day: The construction of democracy through technique". *Cultural Anthropology*, 19(4):551-580.

#### **Further reading**

Mukulika Banerjee. 2008. "Democracy, Sacred and Everyday: An Ethnographic Case from India". In Julia Paley, ed., *Democracy: Anthropological Approaches*, 63-96. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press.

Noah Coburn and Anna Larson. 2014. *Derailing Democracy in Afghanistan: Elections in an Unstable Political Landscape*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Kimberley Coles. 2007. *Democratic Designs: International Intervention and Electoral Practices in Postwar Bosnia-Herzegovina*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Jessica Greenberg. 2014. *After the Revolution: Youth, Democracy, and the Politics of Disappointment in Serbia*. Redwood: Stanford University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Matthew Guttman. 2002. *The Romance of Democracy: Compliant Defiance in Contemporary Mexico*. Berkeley: University of California Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

David Hefner. 2000. *Civil Islam: Muslims and Democratization in Indonesia*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. **Ethnographic monograph**

Aksana Ismailbekova. 2014. "Performing democracy: state-making through patronage in Kyrgyzstan". In Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasanayagam and Judith Beyer (eds), *Ethnographies of the State in Central Asia: Performing Politics*, 78-98. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

David Nugent. 2008. "Democracy Otherwise: Struggles over Popular Rule in Northern Peru." In Julia Paley, ed., *Democracy: Anthropological Approaches*, 21-62. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press.

Julia Paley. 2008. "Introduction" to *Democracy: Anthropological Approaches*. Santa Fe: School of Advanced Research Press.  
[http://sarweb.org/media/files/sar\\_press\\_democracy.pdf](http://sarweb.org/media/files/sar_press_democracy.pdf)

OR

Julia Paley. 2002. "Toward an Anthropology of Democracy." *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 31, 469-496.

Alpa Shah. 2008. "'Keeping the state away': Democracy, politics and the state in India's Jharkhand." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 13, 129-145.

Jonathan Spencer. 2007. "Performing Democracy". In *Anthropology, Politics, and the State: Democracy and Violence in South Asia*, 72-95. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

## **Week 9:**

### **Feeling for the state: questions of affect, intimacy, and popular statism**

---

#### **Essential reading**

Navaro-Yashin. 2002. "Rituals for the State" and "Fantasies for the State". In *Faces of the State: Secularism and Public Life in Turkey*, 117-187.

Juliana Ochs. 2011. "On IKEA and Army Boots: The Domestication of Scurity". In *Security and Suspicion: An Ethnography of Everyday Life in Israel*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 119-137.

#### **Ethnographic monograph**

## Further reading

Christiaan Beyers. Fc. "Moral subjectivity and affective deficit in the transitional state: on claiming land in South Africa." Unpublished MS [BB]

Mateusz Laszczkowski and Madeleine Reeves. FC. "Introduction: Affective States". Unpublished MS, available in Blackboard.

Uli Linke. 2005. "Contact zones: rethinking the sensual life of the state." *Anthropological Theory* 6 (2): 205-225.

Catherine Lutz. 2002. "Making War at Home in the United States: Militarization and the Current Crisis". *American Anthropologist*, 2002, 104 (3): 723-35.

Yael Navaro-Yashin. 2009. "Affective spaces, melancholic objects: ruination and the production of anthropological knowledge." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 15: 1-18.

Michelle Obeid. 2010. "Searching for the Ideal Face of the State in a Lebanese Border Town." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 16: 330-346.

Annabel Pinker and Penny Harvey. Fc. "Negotiating uncertainty: neoliberal statecraft in contemporary Peru". Unpublished MS, will be available in Blackboard.

Madeleine Reeves. 2011. "Fixing the Border: On the Affective Life of the State in Kyrgyzstan." *Environment and Planning, D: Society and Space* 29: 905-923.

Jonathan Spencer. 2007. "Culture, Nation, and Misery." In *Anthropology, Politics, and the State: Democracy and Violence in South Asia*, 48-71. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Jonathan Spencer. 2000. *A Sinhala Village in a Time of Trouble: Politics and Change in Rural Sri Lanka*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

### **Ethnographic monograph**

Jean Comaroff and John Comaroff. 2005. "Naturing the Nation: Aliens, Apocalypse, and the Postcolonial State." In Thomas Blom Hansen and Finn Stepputat, eds., *Sovereign Bodies: Citizens, Migrants and States in the Postcolonial World*, 120-147.

## **Week 10: Rejecting and reclaiming the state: questions of anthropology, anarchism, and critique.**

---

### **Essential reading**

James Scott. 2009. "Hills, Valleys, and States: An Introduction to Zomia". In *The Art of Not Being Governed. An Anarchist History of Upland Southeast Asia*. Yale University Press, 1-39. **Ethnographic monograph**

Review symposium on Scott, *Art of Not Being Governed* in *Perspectives on Politics* (commentaries by Krasner, Roberts, Greenhouse, Manicas, Clunan). *Perspectives on Politics* 9 (1): 79-102.

Stef Jansen. 2013. "Hope for/against the state: gridding in a besieged Sarajevo suburb." *Ethnos* 79 (2): 238-260.

### **Further reading**

David Graeber. 2007. "Introduction" and "Provisional Autonomous Zone: Or, the Ghost-State in Madagascar." In *Possibilities: Essays on Hierarchy, Rebellion, and Desire*, 1-12 and 157-180. Oakland: AK Press.

James Scott. 2012. *Two Cheers for Anarchism. Six Easy Pieces on Autonomy, Dignity, and Meaningful Work and Play*. Princeton: Princeton University Press. [Choose 4 of the fragments]

Alpa Shah. 2010. *In the Shadows of the State. Indigenous Politics, Environmentalism, and Insurgency, in Jharkhand, India*. **Ethnographic monograph**

## **Ethnographic monographs for the book review exercise –**

**If you would like to review another ethnography not listed here, please check with MR first**

Laura Adams. 2010. *The Spectacular State: Culture and National Identity in Uzbekistan*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Ruben Andersson. 2014. *Illegality, Inc.* Berkeley: University of California Press.

Javier Auyero. 2012. *Patients of the State: The Politics of Waiting in Argentina*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Jean-Francois Bayart. 2007. *The State in Africa: The Politics of the Belly*. Cambridge: Polity.

Heath Cabot. 2014. *On the Doorstep of Europe: Asylum and Citizenship in Greece*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Brenda Chalfin. 2010. *Neoliberal Frontiers: An Ethnography of Sovereignty in West Africa*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Catherine Cole. 2009. *Performing South Africa's Truth Commission*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Kimberley Coles. 2007. *Democratic Designs: International Intervention and Electoral Practices in Postwar Bosnia-Herzegovina*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Fernando Coronil. 1997. *The Magical State: Nature, Money, and Modernity in Venezuela*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Julia Elyachar. 2005. *Markets of Dispossession: NGOs, Economic Development, and the State in Cairo*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Didier Fassin. 2013. *Enforcing Order: An Ethnographic Study of Urban Policing*. Cambridge: Polity.

Elizabeth Drexler. 2009. *Aceh, Indonesia: Securing the Insecure State*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

James Ferguson. 1990. *The Anti-Politics Machine: Development, Depoliticization, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

James Ferguson. 2006. *Global Shadows: Africa in the Neoliberal World Order*. Durham and London: Duke University Press.

- Jonathan Friedman. 2011. *Imagining the Post-Apartheid State: An Ethnographic Account of Namibia*. Oxford: Berghahn.
- Clifford Geertz. 1980. *Negara: The Theatre-State in Nineteenth Century Bali*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Lesley Gill. 2004. *The School of the Americas: Military Training and Political Violence in the Americas*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Jessica Greenberg. 2014. *After the Revolution: Youth, Democracy, and the Politics of Disappointment in Serbia*. Redwood: Stanford University Press.
- Susan Greenhalgh. 2008. *Just One Child: Science and Policy in Deng's China*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Akhil Gupta. 2012. *Red Tape: Bureaucracy, Structural Violence, And Poverty in India*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Matthew Guttman. 2002. *The Romance of Democracy: Compliant Defiance in Contemporary Mexico*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Michael Herzfeld. 1992. *The Social Production of Indifference: Exploring the Symbolic Roots of Western Bureaucracy*. Oxford and New York: Berg. Lila Abu-Lughod
- Sharon Hutchinson. 1996. *Nuer Dilemmas: Coping with Money, War, and the State*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Stef Jansen. 2015. *Yearnings in the Meantime: 'Normal Lives' and the State in a Sarajevo Apartment Complex*. Oxford: Berghahn. [Ask MR for a copy of the manuscript].
- Tobias Kelly. 2006. *Law, Violence and Sovereignty Among West Bank Palestinians*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Smadar Lavie. 2014. *Wrapped in the Flag of Israel: Mizrahi Single Mothers and Bureaucratic Torture*. Oxford: Berghahn.
- Sian Lazar. 2008. *El Alto, Rebel City. Self and Citizenship in Andean Bolivia*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Tania Murray Li. 2007. *The Will to Improve: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics*. Durham: Duke University Press.
- Andrew Matthews. 2011. *Instituting Nature: Authority, Expertise, and Power in Mexican Forests*. Boston: MIT Press.

Brinkley Messick. 1993. *The Calligraphic State: Textual Domination and History in a Muslim Society*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Timothy Mitchell. 1998. *Colonising Egypt*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Donald Moore. 2005. *Suffering for Territory: Race, Place, and Power in Zimbabwe*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Eric Mueggler. 2001. *The Age of Wild Ghosts: Memory, Violence and Place in Southwest China*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Florian Muhlfried. 2014. *Being a State and States of Being in Highland Georgia*. Oxford: Berghahn.

Yael Navaro-Yashin. 2002. *Faces of the State: Secularism and Public Life in Turkey*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Yael Navaro-Yashin. 2012. *The Make-Believe Space: Affective Geography in a Post-War Polity*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Diane Nelson. 1999. *A Finger in the Wound: Body Politics in Quincentennial Guatemala*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Carol Nordstrom. 2007. *Global Outlaws: Crime, Money and Power in the Contemporary World*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Zachary Oberfield. 2014. *Becoming Bureaucrats: Socialization at the Frontline of Government Service*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Juliana Ochs. 2011. *Security and Suspicion: An Ethnography of Everyday Life in Israel*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Aihwa Ong. 2006. *Neoliberalism as Exception: Mutations in Citizenship and Sovereignty*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Adriana Petryna. 2002. *Life Exposed: Biological Citizenship After Chernobyl*. Princeton: Princeton University Press

Maria Clemencia Ramirez. 2011. *Between the Guerillas and the State: the Cocalero Movement, Citizenship and Identity in the Colombian Amazon*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Madeleine Reeves. 2014. *Border Work: Spatial Lives of the State in Rural Central Asia*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Janet Roitman. 2005. *Fiscal Disobedience: An Anthropology of Economic Regulation in Central Africa*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press.

James Scott. 1998. *Seeing Like a State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition have Failed*. Yale University Press.

James Scott. 2009. *The Art of Not Being Governed. An Anarchist History of Upland Southeast Asia*. Yale University Press.

Alpha Shah. 2010. *In the Shadows of the State. Indigenous Politics, Environmentalism, and Insurgency, in Jharkhand, India*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Audra Simpson. 2014. *Mohawk Interruptus: Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States*. Durham: Duke University Press.

Jonathan Spencer. 2000. *A Sinhala Village in a Time of Trouble. Politics and Change in Rural Sri Lanka*. Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Nikolai Ssorin-Chaikov. 2003. *The Social Life of the State in Sub-Arctic Siberia*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Alice Street. 2014. *Biomedicine in an Unstable Place*. Durham: Duke University Press

Michael Taussig. 1997. *The Magic of the State*. New York: Routledge.

Laura Wedeen. 1999. *Ambiguities of domination: politics, rhetoric, and symbols in contemporary Syria*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press.

Laura Wedeen. 2008. *Peripheral visions: publics, power, and performance in Yemen*. Chicago, University of Chicago Press.